Minutes

Council Meeting 22nd June 2009



Present:

Councillors	Present	Councillors	Present
J E Abbott	Yes (until 8.40pm)	E R Lynch	Yes
M J Banthorpe	Yes	M Lynch	Apologies
Miss L Barlow	Yes	D Mann	Yes
J Baugh	Apologies	T McArdle	Yes
Mrs J C Beavis	Yes	N G McCrea	Yes
D L Bebb	Yes	J McKee	Yes
E Bishop	Yes	H J Messenger	Yes
R J Bolton	Yes	A M Meyer	Yes
G Butland	Yes	R G S Mitchell	Yes
G Cohen	Apologies	Mrs J M Money	Yes
J C Collar	Yes	Lady Newton	Apologies
M Dunn	Yes	J P O'Reilly-Cicconi	Yes
Mrs E Edey	Yes	Mrs J A Pell	Apologies
J G J Elliott	Yes	R Ramage	Apologies
R Elliston	Yes	D M Reid	Apologies
Dr R L Evans	Yes	D E A Rice	Yes
A V E Everard	Yes	Mrs C Sandbrook	Yes
J H G Finbow	Yes	Mrs W D Scattergood	Yes
Ms L B Flint	Yes	Mrs J W Schmitt	Apologies
T J W Foster	Yes	A F Shelton (Vice Chairman)	Yes
Mrs B A Gage	Yes	Mrs L Shepherd	Yes
M G Gage	Yes	C Siddall	Yes
Mrs M E Galione (Chairman)	Yes	Mrs J A Smith	Apologies
J E B Gyford	Yes	Mrs G A Spray	Yes
N R H O Harley	Yes	F Swallow	Apologies
Mrs S A Howell	Yes	Miss M Thorogood	Yes
P J Hughes	Yes	S M Walsh	Yes(until 9.00pm)
D L Hume	Yes	R G Walters	Yes
M C M Lager	Yes	R N Wilkins	Apologies
S J Lambourne	No	T S Wilkinson	Yes

The Chairman welcomed all Councillors to the meeting and extended a warm welcome to any public and press either present at the meeting or watching the meeting via the webcast.

At the commencement of the meeting the Chairman, Councillor Mrs M E Galione, announced that her chosen charities for the forthcoming Civic Year would be:-

- Brainwave South East Centre. This charity (based in Witham) helps children between the ages of six months to 12 years, who have brain injury, genetic condition or development delay.
- The Alzheimer's Society Mid Essex Branch. This provides a range of services for local people with dementia and their families across the Braintree District.

14 **CHAIRMAN'S ANNOUNCEMENTS**

The Chairman referred to the following issues:-

- (1) **Armed Forces Day.** The Council have taken part in the first ever national Armed Forces Day to honour our service men and women. The Chairman attended the Town Hall Centre, Braintree earlier on 22nd June 2009 to raise a specially designed flag. Other attendees included members from the Royal British Legion, SSAFA, Air Cadets and other Councillors.
- (2) Land Army and Timber Corps Celebration. The Chairman will be hosting an event for past members of the Corps at The Institute, Braintree on 6th July 2009, when 37 ladies and their guests will be in attendance and Lord Petre, the Lord Lieutenant of Essex will present certificates.
- (3) The sad news that **Mrs Wilhemina Drake**, a Braintree District Councillor between 1974-1995, who had recently passed away. A memorial service is to be held on 4th October 2009 at 2.30pm at St Peter's Church, Coggeshall and former colleagues are welcome to attend.

15 **DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

INFORMATION: The following interests were declared:-

- Councillors G Butland, M C M Lager, R G Walters and S M Walsh all declared a personal interest as Essex County Councillors in Agenda Item 7(i) Extract from Cabinet minutes of 11th May 2009 regarding the Rivenhall Airfield Application.
- Councillor J P O'Reilly-Cicconi declared a personal and prejudicial interest in Agenda Item 7(ii) Extract from Cabinet minutes of 8th June 2009 regarding the Core Strategy – Growth Locations reference as the landowner of the site to the north west of Panfield Lane, Braintree, is a friend. In accordance with the Code of Conduct, Councillor O'Reilly-Cicconi, withdrew from the meeting whilst this item was discussed and the vote taken.
- Councillor J E Abbott declared a personal interest in Agenda Item 7(ii) Core Strategy – Growth Locations, as a member of Rivenhall Parish Council and he is known by the speakers from Question Time.

In accordance with the Code of Conduct all Members remained in the meeting for these items, unless stated otherwise, and took part in the debate and decision thereon.

16 **MINUTES**

DECISION: That the minutes of the Annual Meeting of the Council held on 20th April 2009 be approved as a correct record and signed by the Chairman.

17 **QUESTION TIME**

INFORMATION: There was three statements made, the details of which are appended to these minutes.

18 **SCHEME OF DELEGATION**

INFORMATION: The Leader of the Council proposed that the Scheme of Delegation as set out in Part 3 of the Constitution on the Council's website be confirmed.

DECISION: That the Scheme of Delegation as set out in Part 3 of the Constitution be confirmed.

19 POLICY RECOMMENDATIONS AND REFERENCES (PUBLIC SESSION)

(i) <u>Cabinet 11th May 2009</u>

(a) Economic Development Strategy 2009-2013

Councillor Harley, Cabinet Member for Enterprise and Culture, presented the Strategy and highlighted areas where the Council are helping businesses, the skills and vulnerability of those residents losing jobs, the support for the merger of Braintree College and Colchester Institute, and on ways to encourage inward investment, help existing businesses and start-ups. The Strategy will look towards partners and stakeholders, involve the industrial land in the south of the district, the cottage industries, and the villages to the north. It will also encompass the development of the town centres and provide strategic links to the Heart of Essex, the Haven Gateway, and the M11 corridor areas.

Council welcomed the support for small businesses, and the rail and bus transport initiatives. However, the significance of the A120 needs to be recognised as a major east/west route and as this project is slipping the Council should look for improvements at Galleys Corner, Braintree and at Bradwell to be delivered earlier than scheduled.

DECISION: That the District's Economic Development Strategy and Action Plan for 2009-2013 be adopted.

(b) Rivenhall Airfield Application

Councillor Harley, Cabinet Member for Enterprise and Culture, initially advised that the District Council continues to support the countywide Waste Inter Authority Agreement and are not compromised by the planning application for Rivenhall Airfield.

The current planning application proposes an additional paper pulping facility, an increased commercial and industrial waste facility, and will become a site for the importing of waste and, therefore, produce significant traffic movements. The process at the Essex County Council (ECC) Planning Committee on 24th April 2009 was considered unsatisfactory in respect of the facilities made available to the public. The application has been 'called in' by the Secretary of State, and is to be considered in September or October 2009. The District Council continues to be in consultation with affected parishes.

Councillor E R Lynch, on behalf of the Labour Group, thanked Councillor Harley and Councillor Abbott for their contributions at the ECC Planning Committee in April 2009, and continued to request that the statement in the recommendation 'This Council continues to support the Waste Strategy of Essex County Council' be withdrawn to reflect the opposition to the incineration process. If the line cannot be withdrawn it was requested that their concerns be registered. Councillor Abbott agreed that the first sentence of the recommendation is regrettable and should be withdrawn or reworded. The Strategy is a policy

document – not a planning document; and concerns were expressed to the link of the Waste Strategy and PFI's and on delivery of larger sites.

Councillor Harley noted the above concerns and agreed that the Waste Strategy is Council policy, and agreed on combined efforts from the Councillors involved in the

process.

DECISION:

This Council continues to support the Waste Strategy of Essex County Council. However, Braintree District Council reaffirms its' opposition to the revised application for Rivenhall Airfield submitted by Gent Fairhead, as it differs significantly to previous consent. That the Leader be supported retrospectively to write to the Secretary of State to 'call-in' this planning application, on behalf of Braintree District Council.

Furthermore, the Council expresses its concern regarding the process of the ECC Planning Committee on 24th April 2009 in terms of public access and quality of discussion to support this application.

(c) Charges for Property Searches

Councillor Butland referred to the extract from Cabinet 11th May 2009, and the Briefing Note (Appendix E of the Finance reports to Cabinet on 8th June 2009) indicating that the amount involved could exceed that for Cabinet Members to determine under delegated powers.

DECISION: That Local Land Charges be set for 2009/10, after appropriate review.

(ii) Cabinet – 8^{th} June 2009

(a) The Braintree District Sustainable Community Strategy

Council received the Sustainable Community Strategy that has been amended following the consultation process.

DECISION: That the Sustainable Community Strategy be agreed.

(b) Core Strategy – Growth Locations

Councillor McCrea, Chairman of the Local Development Framework Panel, introduced the Local Growth Locations element of the Core Strategy and stated the Panel are 'evidence based', and had included the 'Braintree Futures' assessment to 2025, character assessment of the sites, urban assessments, flood risk assessment, a highways assessment, rural services survey and the current strategic housing land availability assessment. Councillor McCrea advised that many of the recommendations require further work, and continued to present the following references.

Land to the north-west of Braintree – off Panfield Lane

This comprises of a mixed used development of 500 dwellings, and potential uses for a new football stadium, and a new location for Braintree College. Land to the east of Panfield Lane is recommended for omission from the proposed growth location.

DECISION:

- That a proposed growth location at land to the north-west of Braintree
 west of Panfield Lane be included in the Core Strategy.
- (2) That land east of Panfield Lane be excluded from the proposed growth location, in order to retain open space and sporting facilities to serve this part of Bocking.
- (3) That a Master Plan be prepared for the proposed growth location to be approved as a Supplementary Planning Document.

Land to the west of A131, Great Notley

This site is for employment growth proposals, with warehousing being discouraged, and tourism and hotel provision included.

DECISION:

- (1) That the proposed employment growth location at land to the west of the A131 at Great Notley be retained, but warehousing type development discouraged
- (2) That a significant landscape buffer be provided between the Country Park and the employment area.
- (3) That advice be sought from Essex County Highways on the size of the site that could be developed based upon the junction capacity.
- (4) That the Core Strategy be amended to include tourism and hotel use on the site.

Land to the south-west of Witham off Hatfield Road (Lodge Farm)

A proposal for a mixed use development of 600 dwellings with further examination required on potential employment, and highway access issues. The comments from Witham Town Council were appreciated, and this broad area requires additional work and consultation.

Councillor Dr Evans referred to the Witham Local Committee meeting of March 2009 and the significant support not to accept 600 dwellings, and the proposal to limit this to 300 dwellings – a more realistic proposal that has public support. Other Councillors supported the Local Committee's proposal, and raised concern to the large scale greenfield development, the traffic impact at the Lynfield Garage junction of the A12 – a bottleneck junction with significant accident history. Reference was made to the infrastructure/traffic problems content in the report, including the 'Promoting Accessibility for All' function to work with highway authorities on major infrastructure for the proposal. This location was also considered to be a saturation point regarding schools, road and medical facilities; and it was questioned why, under the Core Strategy proposals, Witham had to spread to the outlying villages. However, the Council has sustainable development initiatives to 2025, and this is for appropriate infrastructure with proposed development, including the use of S106 Agreements.

The Leader of the Council advised that the local authority has to find growth areas, and any proposal for reducing the dwellings total should be supported by proposals for alternative sites.

DECISION:

- (1) That the proposed growth location of 600 dwellings at land to the south-west of Witham off Hatfield Road be retained.
- (2) That the suitability of the proposed growth location at land to the south west of Witham for employment development be examined in terms of highway access.

Land to the north east of Witham – off Forest Road in the Parish of Rivenhall

This proposal for 300 dwellings to be provided as an urban extension at this location (in planning terms), although administratively the land lies within the Parish of Rivenhall, is recommended to be excluded from the draft Core Strategy.

This recommendation is based on the views of Witham Local Committee, Rivenhall Parish Council and members of the public. It is considered that the proposal extends too far into the Rivenhall Parish, and will impact onto Rectory Lane. However, this does leave an issue of where to find an alternative site for 300 dwellings.

Councillor Abbott welcomed and supported the recommendation from the Local Development Framework Panel (LDF), and continued to state that 80% of the written responses to consultation, and the views of Witham Local Committee also agrees with this. Further reference was made to a developer's letter stating incorrect facts.

Councillor Lager requested that Council rejects the recommendation. Reference was made to the East of England Plan that dictates provision of growth locations, and legislation from government. The Core Strategy focuses on keeping development around Braintree and Witham, and the red/amber/green method of identifying sites was referred to, and the possible need to look at the villages of Hatfield Peverel, Kelvedon, Feering and Coggeshall. The Forest Road site was quoted as ½ mile from houses in Rivenhall, ¾ mile from Witham railway station and, therefore close to services and accessibility (a factor in the amber settings). The impact to Rectory Lane and the setting of the Parish Boundary was referred to and Members were requested to reject the recommendation.

Many Witham Councillors disagreed with this on grounds of

- major traffic problems
- commuter parking problems in Witham stretching to on-street parking away from the railway station
- the site being protected by Green Wedge legislation
- the Rivenhall Village Plan being an adopted, development document
- the open countryside
- the site being completely unsuitable
- the views of Witham Local Committee and local residents
- the result of the questionnaire on growth locations, and what is the point of consultation if the Council does not listen
- that alternative sites could be found although this could take months

In response, the Leader of the Council, advised that no other proposal had been put forward for a location for 300 homes and that Councillors had a dual responsibility as

Ward Member and Council Member. When the planning application is submitted all issues can be considered, including highways access.

Councillor Abbott requested that the vote to support the recommendation from the LDF for the proposed growth location of 300 dwellings at Land to the north east of Witham – off Forest Road in the Parish of Rivenhall not being retained in the Core Strategy be recorded.

The results of the recorded vote were as follows:-

For the Motion

Councillors: Abbott, Ms Barlow, Bishop, Dr Evans, Everard, Foster, Gyford, Hughes, Hume, E Lynch, Mann, McCrea, Messenger, Meyer, O'Reilly-Cicconi, Rice, and Ms Thorogood. (17)

Against the Motion

Councillors: Banthorpe, Mrs Beavis, Bebb, Bolton, Butland, Collar, Dunn, Mrs Edey, Elliott, Elliston, Finbow, Ms Flint, M Gage, Mrs Gage, Mrs Galione, Harley, Mrs Howell, Lager, McArdle, McKee, Mitchell, Mrs Money, Mrs Sandbrook, Mrs Scattergood, Shelton, Mrs Shepherd, Siddall, Mrs Spray, Walsh, Walters and Wilkinson. (31)

Abstained

No Councillors (0)

Absent

Councillors: Baugh, Cohen, Lambourne, M Lynch, Lady Newton, Mrs Pell, Ramage, Reid, Mrs Schmitt, Mrs Smith, Swallow, and Wilkins. (12)

The motion was declared **LOST**

Councillor Abbott chose to withdraw from the meeting at this point.

Councillor Lager moved the recommendation for 300 houses at Land to the north east of Witham – off Forest Road in the Parish of Rivenhall to be retained in the Core Strategy.

DECISION: That the proposed growth location of 300 dwellings at land to the north-east of Witham off Forest Road is retained in the Core Strategy.

Land to the north-east of Witham (adjacent to Eastways/Waterside Park) in the Parish of Rivenhall

This refers to an urban extension of about 6.0 hectares of general employment land and, in planning terms is an urban extension to Witham, although administratively the land is within the Parish of Rivenhall. The LDF had proposed that this be removed from the Core Strategy, as this land is not required for the foreseeable future.

DECISION: That the proposed growth location (for 6.0 hectares of general employment) at land to the north-east of Witham (adjacent to Eastways/Waterside Park) be removed from the Core Strategy.

(c) Financial Outturn reports for 2008/09 and 2009/10 update

Council gave consideration to the recommendations from Cabinet.

DECISION:

- (1) That a budget provision of £75,000 for repairs to the boundary wall of St Marys Closed Churchyard, Bocking be agreed, subject to the requirement to incur expenditure being agreed by the Cabinet Member for Efficiency and Resources.
- (2) That the Budget Carry Forward requests from 2008/09 and New Bids for 2009/10 be endorsed.
- (3) That the allocation of £110,111 for improving non-decent properties in the private sector occupied by vulnerable people from GO-EAST be added to Housing Grants budget in 2009/10.
- (4) That the budget bid for temporary accommodation costs at £80,000, as detailed in Appendix B of the report be approved. The release of funds to be subject to submission of a business case and authorisation by the Leader of the Council.

(d) Proposed Disposal of the Riverside Site, Braintree

The Chairman agreed that this item could be taken in Public Session.

DECISION: That £1m be made available from the Capital Programme towards affordable housing, associated with the scheme.

20 **STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS (PUBLIC SESSION)**

INFORMATION: Councillor E R Lynch, referred to two Written Questions he had submitted during May 2009 relating to planning applications and masts being sited on the approach to our towns. Reference was made to two previous applications located at White Courts, Great Notley and at Coggeshall Road, Braintree and an inconsistency on these applications and the use of Policy RLP162. Assurance was requested for officers to look at similar applications and apply a consistent recommendation. Secondly, it was requested that when a planning application is made to Council that relevant Ward members receive written notification by email or post. Councillor Lynch is aware that planning lists are published weekly, and one of the aforementioned planning applications appeared at the end of the list and was overlooked by all six Ward Councillors. A change of notification procedures to Ward Members was therefore requested.

In response, Councillor Harley, the Cabinet Member for Enterprise and Culture stated that any inconsistencies in the use of RLP162 would be taken up with Planning Officers; and that notification procedures are looked at, although Ward Members can request to be notified of planning lists and for further information.

21 QUESTION TIME (PUBLIC SESSION)

(i) Statements from the Leader and Cabinet Members

INFORMATION: The Leader of the Council referred to the introduction of written reports from Cabinet Members being included in the agenda papers and requested member feedback.

Further updates were provided by the Leader and Cabinet Members.

East of England Regional Assembly (EERA) – Sub National Review.

The Leader of the Council reported on the Executive Committee Meeting of EERA on 12th June 2009 and the planned implementation of the Sub National Review in the East of England later in 2009. The regional structure will be redesigned when the Regional Assemblies stop, and EEDA takes over, and this will affect democratic accountability. A Leader's Board, comprising of 52 members from County, District, and Unitary authorities and the Broads Authority will meet, and there will be significant differences with no

stakeholders and no non-elected politicians. It will also comprise of 10 Members (to achieve political balance) on a panel to interface with EEDA.

Roll-out of Wheelie-bins.

Councillor Walters, Cabinet Member for Environment and Sustainability, referred to the article in a national newspaper on the roll-out of wheelie-bins, and stated they had been misinformed and ill advised on this item. There is a high level of satisfaction in the Braintree District on roll-out and 50% performance levels of recycling, and October will bring a further roll-out to the remaining parts of the district. This will result with just 1,700 homes on black-sack collection on a bi-weekly basis.

The entire district is to be re-routed on waste collection, and people's problems on waste services will continue to the dealt with sympathetically. Since the signing of the Waste Inter-Authority Agreement with Essex County Council, additional funding has been given that will allow the bi-weekly collection of green waste during winter months to continue; and for the introduction of a bi-weekly food waste collection service.

Council deposits in Icelandic Banks. Councillor Lager, Cabinet Member for Efficiency and Resources, advised that £4m of the £5m deposited with the Icelandic Banks should be recoverable. The Council's Statement of Accounts and papers to the Audit Committee later in June will reflect this.

Sustainable Rural Communities seminar. Councillor Mrs Beavis, Cabinet Member for Customers and Communication, advised that this event on 26th June 2009 had been cancelled.

(ii) Oral Questions

INFORMATION: Members were invited to ask any questions of the Leader on non-operational matters and the following questions were asked: -

Councillor E R Lynch, referred to his role as Chairman of the Waste and Recycling Task and Finish Group and welcomed the bi-weekly food collection initiative. With regard to the **refurbished play area at Chelmer Road**, near Colne Walk, concern was expressed on the gates opening outwards towards the road and near a bend, and the possibility of children running out - especially as the hedgeway is overgrown and limits visibility splays. It was requested that funds be found to rectify this. In response, Councillor Walters noted the concerns and would address them.

Councillor Gyford referred to the composition of **the People's Panel** and the need for a cross section of the whole community.

In response, Councillor Bebb, Deputy Cabinet Member for Customers and Communication, who is leading on this issue advised that full representation is being sought – both geographically and demographically, with any gaps being identified and addressed. The use of library vans in the north of the county are being utilised, and that representation for elderly persons is adequate, and contact made with local schools to attract young representatives.

Councillor M Gage was pleased that the majority of the **investments in the Icelandic Banks** would be recovered, and questioned when this would be received. Councillor Lager responded that the Friedlander bank would be October 2012, the Landsbanki bank between 2010 and 2012, and the Glitnir bank in 2010.

Councillor M Gage queried, with the RDA being abolished by an incoming Conservative government, would the Leader be for **local policy or Conservative policy**.

In response, the Leader of the Council, stated that the Conservative policy document 'control shift' gives a commitment to local authorities in regions on how to deal with transportation, housing, and planning. The Regional Spatial Strategy would be replaced with a local development framework style if the local authority wishes.

Councillor Dr Evans directed queries towards Councillors Walters on the Council's policy for **assisted wheelie-bins**, e.g. for those people with disabilities; and on **Pest Control Charges** (as at 1st April 2009) for the clearance of wasp and ants nests and whether there was a 'sliding scale'.

In response, the Councillor Walters advised that assisted collection can be made, and for those persons with disabilities the Council will collect, and for those persons who cannot manage and have not got family locally to assist them. With respect of the Pest Control Charges – these will be sent to Councillor Dr Evans.

Councillor Dr Evans referred to the proposed **Merger of Braintree College and Colchester Institute**, and the localism view of Witham Local Committee that the name should stay as Braintree College.

Responding to this, Councillor Harley advised that this will be a matter for the Governors to decide and it is hoped that Braintree appears in the title, as it is a facility for the district and town.

Councillor Everard also raised a question regarding the investments with the **Icelandic Banks**, and whether the prospective interest would be lost. Councillor Lager answered that the Statement of Accounts would provide an explanation and indicate any interest, and to contact him, if required.

(iii) Chairmen's Statements

INFORMATION: No statements were made.

(iv) <u>Meetings in Public Session</u>

INFORMATION: Members were invited to raise any matters arising from meetings that had been held in public session since the last Council meeting on 6th April 2009.

22 BUSINESS OF EXTERNAL ORGANISATIONS

INFORMATION: There were no reports received from Council representatives on external organisations.

As there were no items in private session, the Chairman closed the meeting.

The meeting commenced at 7.15pm and closed at 9.24pm.

Mrs M E Galione (Chairman)

APPENDIX

COUNCIL MEETING

22ND JUNE 2009

PUBLIC QUESTION TIME

Summary of Questions Asked / Statements Made During Public Question Time

1. <u>Statement from Bob Wright, 303 Rickstones Road, Rivenhall</u> Agenda Item 7(ii) – Core Strategy and Growth Locations

Mr Wright expressed his thanks to the Local Development Framework (LDF) Panel in supporting residents and recommending that Forest Road, Rivenhall be removed from the Strategic Plan. This area is close to a commercial site and local railway line, although the railway station is inaccessible compared to other possible sites in Witham, and Mr Wright urged the Council to remove Forest Road from the next Plan.

With regard to the industrial site from Eastways to the Waterside Park area, in Rivenhall it was noted that 50 units in Witham currently stand empty with 246,000² ft of vacant brownfield land, therefore providing a total of 600,000² ft of land availability in Witham. Mr Wright suggested that the Eastways/Waterside Park site was not required and could also be removed from the Strategy.

2. <u>Statement by George Harris, Glebe Farm Cottage, Rectory Lane, Rivenhall Agenda Item 7(ii) – Core Strategy and Growth Locations</u>

Mr Harris, as a resident of Rectory Lane, also ratified the recommendation from the LDF Panel of 20th May 2009 to remove the Forest Road site at Rivenhall from the Core Strategy. The characteristics of the Forest Road/Rectory Lane area were quoted, including the presence of a Grade II Listed Building.

3. <u>Statement by Jack Prime, Chairman of Rivenhall Parish Plan Steering Group</u>
Agenda Item 7(ii) – Core Strategy and Growth Locations

Mr Prime spoke regarding the Forest Road site being removed from the Core Strategy and stated that if the site were to be included in the Growth Locations it would conflict with the Rivenhall Parish Plan, the Village Design Statement (VDS), and the Parish Appraisal; plus the VDS approved by the District Council. It is important to protect boundaries between Witham and Rivenhall and keep areas open, and Rectory Lane has 'protected lane' status, is part of the John Ray Walk and, therefore, very popular with walkers; has quiet rural characteristics and has little traffic in the area. There are urban homes along the greater part of the lane, and to develop this further would destroy its' character. The end of the lane is within 200yards of the Rickstones hamlet and Mr Prime accentuated his support for this site to be removed from the Plan.